

## PARAPHRASTIC APPROACH TO INCREASE STUDENTS' WRITING SKILL IN ANALYZING INTRINSIC ELEMENTS ON JAMES JOYCE'S SHORT STORIES

Risma Kartika Dewi<sup>1</sup>, Novi Sriwulandari<sup>2</sup>, Muhammad Ainul Yaqin<sup>3</sup>

<sup>123</sup>Universitas Gresik, Jl. Arif Rahman Hakim 2B, Gresik, Indonesia

[rismakartika88@gmail.com](mailto:rismakartika88@gmail.com) (+6281216600185); [noviwulandari2811@gmail.com](mailto:noviwulandari2811@gmail.com) (+6281232256945); [muhammadaainulyaqin044a@gmail.com](mailto:muhammadaainulyaqin044a@gmail.com) (+6285733641917)

### ABSTRACT

*Book Report I is a compulsory subject in English Literature Department's curriculum of 2<sup>nd</sup> semester that focuses on analyzing literary work. The researchers observed that some students still have low motivation in studying literature of that course. It can be seen through their low score either from their task or middle/final test. Based on those reasons, the researchers try to apply a suitable way or technique in teaching literature for Book Report I. Paraphrastic approach is considered to be the best technique to enhance students' motivation in analyzing short stories in terms of elements of a story. There are some activities that are applied by the lecturer to the students in Paraphrastics approach before the students are going to be analyze literary work by themselves. By applied Paraphrastic approach, the students are hoped to be able to analyze short story easily. Besides, their scores either from their task or middle/final task are hoped to be able to increase. The research design of the study is quasi-experimental. Thus, there are two groups that are involved in this study, experimental group and control group. Experimental group is taught Paraphrastic approach and control group is taught other technique instead of Paraphrastic approach. The data is quantitative. The source of data was collected from the scores of students' work in analyzing elements of a story in terms of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration. The research subject will be the 2<sup>nd</sup> semester students of English Literature Department in Universitas Gresik especially who are taking Book Report I as a compulsory subject. The research is conducted in seven meetings that are two meetings for pre-post tests and five meetings for the treatments. Then, the data analysis is done by using IBM Statistics SPSS 22. The finding of this study shows that there is improvement of both groups from pre-test scores to post-test scores in terms of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration. Nevertheless, the result of the study shows that the students' scores of post-test in experimental group is better than in control group. Thus, it can be said that there is significant different result between students who are trained Paraphrastic approach and those of students without Paraphrastic approach training. It can be concluded that applying Paraphrastic approach to the students had been proven effective to increase students' skill in writing literary analysis.*

**KEYWORDS:** Paraphrastic Approach, Short Story, Intrinsic Elements of Story, Writing Skill

# 1 INTRODUCTION

Literature is a subject that works together through moral, culture, knowledge and psychology. A distinction between literature and literary studies is that literature is an art and literary studies are species knowledge of learning (Wellek & Warren, 2011). Readers can learn social culture, problems, and contradiction of people's life by analyzing literature work through literary studies. Literature is an art of languages which is more than just for entertainment but also enhance students' competence in written, oral, analytic skill.

In order to enhance the students' ability in studying literature, the researchers try to apply Paraphrastic approach in teaching Book Report. Book Report I is a compulsory subject of Literature Department's Curriculum in Universitas Gresik. Paraphrastic approach deals with the surface meaning of a text (Hwang & Embi, 2007). It means that the students are hoped to understand the meaning of the text through some Paraphrastic activities. Rosli (1995) states that it allows teacher to use simpler word and sentences structures compared to more complicated ones in the texts and sometimes teacher can translate it into other languages. As a lecturer or teacher, the researchers try to apply this approach which is suitable for the beginners in formulating original assumption of a literary work.

There are four activities that are taught to the students by the lecturer in teaching Paraphrastic approach. Those activities are (1) re-tell the text to the students or use simple terms to explain what the story is about to the students, (2) discuss what author says in the text by giving questions to the students, (3) ask the students to express the answer by using their own word from the sentences/paragraphs of the text (4) get the students to write an analysis about the elements of the story of the text (Mustakim et al., 2014). The literary works used in Book Report I can be literature books, hand out of literature theories, novel and short story. The researcher chooses short story because it is suitable for the beginners in studying literature. The researcher interests in applying James Joyce's Short Stories for the subject of the research because those are interpretative literary work which is hoped to be able to train the students' ability in analyzing text.

The students will do the analysis of intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short stories. It is a basic literature approach that is suitable theory to be taught in Book Report I. These intrinsic elements consist of five points that are (1) plot, (2) setting, (3) character and characterization, (4) point of view and (5) theme (Bikerts, 1993). Firstly, plot is the sequence of events in the story or play. Secondly, setting is time and location that story takes place. Thirdly, characters are people in a work of fiction and characterization is their characteristics that will be analyzed. Fourthly, point of view is the angle from which the story is told. The last, theme is a central message (moral of the story) that is also be said the author's thought on the topic of the story.

There are two previous studies taken in conducting this research. Firstly, Mustakim et al. (2014) did a research entitled Teacher's Approaches in Teaching Literature: Observations of ESL Classroom. That research aimed to identify the approaches employed by teachers in teaching Contemporary Children. Secondly, Rashid et al. (2010) did a research entitled Approaches Employed by teachers in Teaching Literature to Less

Proficient Students in Form 1 and Form 2. That study aimed to gain a general overview of the approaches and strategies employed by teachers in teaching literature to less proficient students in form 1 and form 2. Both of those research aimed to identify approaches employed by the teachers in teaching literature. The result of the research done by Mustakim et al. (2014) showed that Paraphrastics Approach and Information-Based Approach were among the most favored approaches in the teaching of literature. Besides, Findings in research by Rashid et al. (2010) show that the information-based approach is popularly employed by teachers, followed by moral-philosophical approach and paraphrastic approach. Therefore, the researcher interests to apply Paraphrastic approach to increase students' ability in analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short stories in Book Report I subject.

Based on the background of the study, the research problem of this study is: "Is there any difference in students' analysis score of intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story who taught by using Paraphrastic approach and those of the students who are not taught by using Paraphrastic approach in terms of focus, supporting reason, organization, convention and integration?"

## 2 MATERIALS AND METHODS

This study was carried by using quasi-experimental. Quasi-experimental studies are frequently used by educators. In quasi-experimental research design, individuals that are assigned to the groups may have selection factors (Creswell, 2012). It means that investigator or researcher does not randomly assign participants to groups. Since this study used quasi-experimental research design, there were two groups taken as the investigated groups. The first group is experimental group that is taught by using paraphrastic approach. While, the second group is control group that is taught by using other technique instead of paraphrastic approach. The experimental group receives a treatment, while the control group receives no treatment (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2009). The design of the study can be illustrated as follows:

**TABLE I**  
**Quasi-experimental Design**

<b>Group</b>	<b>Pretest</b>	<b>Treatment</b>	<b>Posttest</b>
Experimental	T <sub>1</sub> E	X	T <sub>2</sub> E
Control	T <sub>1</sub> C	-	T <sub>2</sub> C

(Taken from Creswell, 2012)

Where:

- T<sub>1</sub>E : Pretest of analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story in experimental group
- T<sub>1</sub>C : Pretest of analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story in control group
- X : Treatment by applying Paraphrastic approach to experimental group
- T<sub>2</sub>E : Posttest of analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story in experimental group
- T<sub>2</sub>C : Posttest of analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story in control group

The data of this research is quantitative data. According to Ary et al. (2010), quantitative data are usually in the form of numbers that is analyzed by using various statistical procedures. The data are used to answer research problem of this study.

The source of data will be collected from the students' scores in analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story in terms of focus, supporting reason, reasoning, organization, convention and integration at the second semester students of English Literature Department who study Book Report I as the compulsory subject in English Literature Department's Curriculum. By applying Paraphrastic approach in Book Report I course, the students are hoped to be able to analyze short story easily. Besides, their scores either from their task or middle/final task are hoped to be able to increase.

Fraenkel & Wallen (2009) define instrumentation as the whole process of preparing to collect data in a research. The instrument used in this study a test about asking the students to analyze intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story. The scores of students' test is used to know whether Paraphrastic approach increase students' ability in analyzing intrinsic elements on James Joyce's short story. Those scores are collected through pretest and posttest, that are conducted in both experimental group and control group. The instrument of the study is a short test instruction that is stated in the following figure.

<u>Students' Task</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Please analyze intrinsic elements (plot, character and characterization, setting, theme and plot) on James Joyce's short story entitled "<i>Araby</i>"</li><li>• Elaborate those elements in details</li></ul>

**Figure I. Research Instrument**

There are some steps that are arranged in conducting the research. *First*, try out test will be administered to five students. *Second*, pre-test is given to the both experimental and control groups. The result of the test is collected and analyzed to get preliminary data about the students' ability in analyzing intrinsic elements of James Joyce's short story. *Third*, the experimental group is taught by using paraphrastic approach and the control is not taught by using paraphrastic approach. *Fourth*, post-test is administered to experimental group and control group. Each of the steps are explained as follows.

#### 1) Administering Try-out Test

Five students who were not as subjects of the study were given a try out test to analyze intrinsic elements of James Joyce's short story. It was aimed to know whether Development of Scoring Rubrics in Writing Literary Criticism by Apriliadi & Suryaman (2020) is suitable to measure the result of students' analysis or not. The assessment was done by the first and second researcher who were also the lecturer in

English Literature Department of Universitas Gresik. The two researchers gave the same score of the students' analysis, it means that Development of Scoring Rubrics in Writing Literary Criticism can be applied to assess students' analysis.

2) Administering Pre-test

After conducting try out test to the students, pre-test was given to both of experimental and control groups.

3) Conducting treatments

The treatments were conducted in three times for each group. In experimental group, the students were taught by using Paraphrastic approach while the students in control group were taught by using other technique that is language-based approach. The researcher used various of James Joyce's short story as the teaching material to be analyzed in those treatments.

4) Administering post-test

Post-test was conducted after the whole treatments had been given to the both groups.

The rating scores used for measuring the improvement of students' scores in analyzing intrinsic elements of James Joyce's short story is taken from Development of Scoring Rubrics in Writing Literary Criticism by Apriliadi & Suryaman (2020). This scoring is suitable to measure the intrinsic elements of story that are plot; character and characterization; setting; theme; and point of view. This type of rating scores is categorized into analytic scoring method. It is done to make the scoring system easier. Furthermore, in testing a large number of students is more objective and consistent by using analytic scoring method.

Each scoring criteria is defined into five short statements that helped to make the test reliable. It is also against subjectivity since it provides clear, precise, and mutually exclusive statements for each point of scales. The score of each criteria of the elements were 5, 4, 3, 2 and 1. The table of scoring rubrics is stated below.

**TABLE II**  
**Development of Scoring Rubrics in Writing Literary Criticism**  
**by Apriliadi & Suryaman (2020)**  
**Writing Literary Criticism**

Criteria	Very good 5	Good 4	Fair 3	Poor 2	Very poor 1	Total Score	Assessment points
Focus	All ideas and sub-topics elaborated in literary criticism are detailed and specifics	Most of the ideas and sub-topics elaborated in literary criticism are detailed but less specifics	A small number of ideas and subtopics elaborate in literary criticism are detailed	Ideas and sub-topics elaborated in literary criticism lacking in detail, less specific, and dubious	All ideas and sub-topics elaborated in literary criticism are not explained clearly		

			and specific		
<b>Supporting reasons</b>	All criticism of literary works is conveyed in depth, accurate, objective, and full of credibility, provided by clear reasons	Most criticisms of literary works are conveyed in depth, accuracy, objectivity, and has a credibility, provided quite clear reasons	A small portion of criticism of literary works is conveyed in depth, accuracy, objectivity and credible, but didn't provide any reasons	Criticism of literary works is less in depth, less accurate, less objective, and less of credibility	All criticism of literary works is conveyed in no depth, inaccurately, not objectively, and not credible
<b>Organization</b>	Grammar, diction, spelling and punctuation are all good and right	The sentence structure used in reviewing literary works is good and right, but has a slightly writing error	The sentence structure used in reviewing literary works is quite good	The sentence structure used in reviewing literature is good but the sentence is incomplete	The sentence structure used in reviewing literary works is not good enough
<b>Convention</b>	Grammar, diction, spelling, and punctuation are all good and right	Grammar, diction, spelling, and punctuation are good and right, but has a slightly writing error	Grammar, diction, spelling, and punctuation are quite good.	One of the grammar, diction, spelling, and punctuation is not good enough	Grammar, diction, spelling and punctuation are not good enough
<b>Integration</b>	All aspects of literary criticism are good and fit the characteristics of literary criticism	Most aspects of literary criticism are good, there are characteristics of literary criticism that have not yet been emerged	Most aspects of literary criticism fit into the characteristics of literary criticism	Most aspects of literary criticism do not fit the characteristics of literary criticism	All aspects of literary criticism do not fit the characteristics of literary criticism
<b>Total Score</b>					

The subject is second semester students of English Literature Department, Universitas Gresik. The researchers divide that class into two groups randomly. The first group is experimental group that consists of 10 students and the second group is control group that consists of 10 students. The quantitative data of the research is the students' scores of pre-test and post-test result. After scoring the test, the result was analyzed statistically to evaluate the improvement of students' scores in analyzing intrinsic elements of James Joyce's short story in terms of focus, supporting reason, organization, convention and integration. The collected data were calculated by using IBM Statistic SPSS 22.

### 3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The analysis of *Paired Samples Test* of focus, supporting reasons, organization convention and integration in pre-test and post-test of experimental group was presented as follows.

**TABLE III**  
**Paired Sample Test of Experimental Group**

	Paired Differences				
	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
				Lower	Upper
Pair 1*	-3.75000	5.75779	1.17530	-6.18130	-1.31870
Pair 2*	-4.58333	7.21060	1.47186	-7.62810	-1.53856
Pair 3*	-3.75000	5.75779	1.17530	-6.18130	-1.31870
Pair 4*	-4.16667	7.75532	1.58305	-7.44145	-.89188
Pair 5*	-5.00000	10.21508	2.08514	-9.31345	-.68655

	T	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
Pair 1*	-3.191	23	.004
Pair 2*	-3.114	23	.005
Pair 3*	-3.191	23	.004
Pair 4*	-2.632	23	.015
Pair 5*	-2.398	23	.025

\*Pair 1: focus in pretest and focus in posttest

\*Pair 2: supporting reasons pretest and supporting reason posttest

\*Pair 3: organization pretest and reasoning posttest

\*Pair 4: convention pretest and organization posttest

\*Pair 5: integration pretest and organization posttest

Then, to find out the improvement of students' writing analysis of James Joyce short story in terms of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration; Pallant (2007) proposed Eta squared to find the effect size of the treatment toward to the students' scores. The following formula is one way to calculate the effect size statistics.

$$Eta\ squared = \frac{t^2}{t^2 + (N-1)}$$

According to Cohen's guideline in Pallant (2007), the interpretation of *Eta squared* was presented in the following table.

**TABLE IV**  
**Cohen's Guideline**

Size	Eta squared (% of variances explained)
Small	0.01 or 1 %
Medium	0.06 or 6 %
Large	0.138 or 138 %

The value of *t* in terms of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration in *Paired Samples Test* is computed by using *Eta squared* (Pallant, 2007) to know the increasing of students' scores after given treatment by applying Paraphrastic approach to experimental group. Through the calculation to know how much the effect was of giving Paraphrastic approach in increasing students' scores of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration was obtained the value of *Eta Squared* as follows: (1) the value of *Eta squared* for Focus of Pair 1 was 0.307; (2) the value of *Eta squared* for Supporting Reasons of Pair 2 was 0.296; (3) the value of *Eta squared* for Organization of Pair 3 was 0.307; (4) the value of *Eta squared* for Convention of Pair 4 was 0.231; and (5) the value of *Eta squared* for Integration of Pair 5 was 0.200.

Through the value of *Eta squared* in experimental group can be concluded that Paraphrastic approach gave a large effect in increasing students' scores in terms of Focus, Supporting reasons, Organization, Convention and Integration on writing literary analysis. The analysis of *Paired Samples Test* of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration in pre-test and post-test of control group was presented as follows.

**TABLE V**  
**Paired Sample Test of Control Group**

	Paired Differences				
	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
				Lower	Upper
Pair 1*	-1.66667	5.64660	1.15261	-4.05102	.71768
Pair 2*	-1.66667	7.01964	1.43288	-4.63080	1.29747
Pair 3*	-2.08333	5.88230	1.20072	-4.56721	.40054
Pair 4*	-.41667	4.64306	.94776	-2.37726	1.54392
Pair 5*	-.41667	6.90253	1.40897	-3.33135	2.49802

  

	T	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
Pair 1*	-1.446	23	.162
Pair 2*	-1.163	23	.257
Pair 3*	-1.735	23	.096
Pair 4*	-.440	23	.664
Pair 5*	-.296	23	.770



- \*Pair 1: focus in pretest and focus in posttest
- \*Pair 2: supporting reasons pretest and supporting reason posttest
- \*Pair 3: organization pretest and reasoning posttest
- \*Pair 4: convention pretest and organization posttest
- \*Pair 5: integration pretest and organization posttest

Then, the value of  $t$  in terms of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration in *Paired Samples Test* is computed by using *Eta squared* (Pallant, 2007) to know the the increasing of students' scores in control group. Through the calculation to know how much the effect was of working in pairs in increasing students' scores of focus, supporting reasons, organization, convention and integration was obtained the value of *Eta Squared* as follows: (1) the value of *Eta squared* for Focus of Pair 1 was 0.083; (2) the value of *Eta squared* for Supporting Reasons of Pair 2 was 0.055; (3) the value of *Eta squared* for Organization of Pair 3 was 0.115; (4) the value of *Eta squared* for Convention of Pair 4 was 0.0083; and (5) the value of *Eta squared* for Integration of Pair 5 was 0.0037.

The value of *Eta squared* in control group shows that working in pairs gave medium effect size in improving students' Focus and Organization in writing; small effect size in improving students' Supporting Reasons; and no effect size in Convention and Integration.

## 4 CONCLUSION

From the explanation above, the actualization of the teacher's role is reflected in three stages. First, Input. In this stage the teacher actualizes the role starting from planning learning, determining learning strategies, preparing control tools, and ensuring that at this stage it goes well, a learning contract is made that contains a mutual consensus between the teacher and students. Second, process. At this stage of the process, the teacher ensures that the learning process is in accordance with the plans that have been made, where in planning the teacher has designed learning with religious moderation content. In addition, the teacher chooses a learning strategy. The learning strategy chosen is based on the principle of student-centered learning, so that the appropriate learning strategies are inquiry, social inquiry and contextual teaching and learning (CTL) strategies. The next step is for teachers to prepare control tools to monitor student activities, develop local culture in learning materials, and include multicultural values in the learning curriculum. After the input and process stages are carried out, it will produce output. This output is the building of the expected value of moderation at MIN 1 Lamongan. The moderating value that grows and develops is the attitude of *tasamuh* (tolerance), this attitude is done so that there are no disputes between students with one another and so that students can respect their friends and respect their teachers . *Musawah* (equation), this attitude needs to be taught to students so that no students discriminate between one friend and another. *Syuro* (deliberation), this attitude is taught when students face a problem in order to solve it with a cool head by conducting deliberation to reach an agreement. The attitude of *tawassuth* (taking the middle way),

this attitude can always position oneself in social life so that he is able to behave well both in the school environment and outside the school environment. and the last is the attitude of tawazun, this attitude means balance in decision making, neither extreme right nor extreme left.

## REFERENCES

- Akbar, Achmad. " Peran Guru PAI dalam Membangun Moderasi Beragama di SDN Beriwit 4 dan SDN Danau Usung 1 Kabupaten Murung Raya". Skripsi-Institut Agama Islam Negeri Palangka Raya, 2020.
- Al-Mandzur, Jamaluddin Muhammad bin Mukram Ibn. *Lisan-al-Arab*. Beirut: Dar Shadir. 2010.
- Al-Munawar, Said Agil Husin. *Fikih Hubungan Antar Agama*. Jakarta: Ciputat Press. 2005.
- Al-Qur'an Terjemah dan Tajwid. Bandung: Sygma Creative Media Crop, 2014.
- Amar, Abu. *Pendidikan Islam Wasathiyah ke-Indonesiaan* Jurnal: al- Insiroh, Vol. 2, No. 2, (2018): 5.
- Arikunto, Suharsimi. *Prosedur Penelitian*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2001.
- Bungin, Burhan. *Metode Penelitian Sosial*. Surabaya: Airlangga Universiti Perss, 2001.
- 'Asyur, Ibnu. *At-Tahrir Wa At-Tanwir*. Tunis: ad-Dar Tunisiyyah, 1984.
- Az-Zuhaili, Muhammad. *Moderat dalam Islam*. Jakarta: Akbar Media Eka Sarana, 2005.
- Bamualim, Chaider S., dkk, *Kaum Muda Muslim Milenial Konservatisme, Hibridasi Identitas dan Tantangan Radikalisme*. Tangerang Selatan: Center for The Study of Religion and Culture, 2018.
- Dachmiati, Sabrina. "Program Bimbingan Kelompok Untuk Mengembangkan Sikap dan Kebiasaan Belajar Siswa". *Jurnal Ilmu Kependidikan* Vol. II, No. 1, (Maret 2015): 14.
- Hamid, Abdul. "Guru Profesional", *Jurnal Al-Falah* Vol. XVII, No. 32 (2017):275.
- Hasan, Mustaqim. "Prinsip Moderasi Beragama Dalam Kehidupan Berbangsa", *Jurnal Muhtadiin*, Vol. 7, No. 02 (Juli-Desember 2021): 116.
- Hermawan, Sigit. *Metodologi Bisnis: Pendekatan Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif*. Malang: Media Nusa Creative, cet I, 2016.
- Ikmal, H., & Setianingrum, S. A. (2018). Strategi Guru Al-Qur'an Hadits Dalam Mengatasi Kesulitan Belajar Membaca Al-Qur'an Peserta Didik. *Akademika*, 12(02).
- Ikmal, H., & Sukaeni, W. (2021). Inovasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Multiple Intelligences Di Sman 1 Kedungpring Lamongan. *Kuttab: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Islam*, 5(1), 34-47.

- Junaedi, Edi. "Inilah Moderasi Beragama", *Jurnal Multikultural & Multireligius*, Vol. 18, No. 2, Jakarta Pusat: Kementerian Agama RI, (November 2019): 396.
- Kementerian Agama. *Gerak Langkah Pendidikan Islam Untuk Moderasi Beragama: Potret Penguatan Islam Rahmatan Lil Alamin melalui Pendidikan Islam*. Ciputat Tangerang Selatan: Indonesian Muslim CrisisCenter (IMMC), 2019.
- Kementerian Agama RI. *Moderasi Beragama*. Jakarta: Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI, 2019.
- Kunandar. *Langkah Mudah Penelitian Tindakan Kelas*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 2001.
- Mannan, Abdul. *Ahlussunnah Wal Jamaah Akidah Umat Islam Indoensia*. Kediri: PP. Al Falah Ploso Kediri, 2012.
- Masturaini. "Penanaman Nilai-nilai Moderasi Beragama di Pondok Pesantren (Studi Pondok Pesantren *Shohifatushshofa* NW Rawamangun Kecamatan Sukamaju, Kabupaten Luwu Utara". *Thesis-Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Palopo*, 2021.
- Meiyanto, Sito. *Persepsi Nilai, dan Sikap*. Modul 3.0. Yogyakarta: Minat Utama Manajemen Rumah Sakit.
- Meleong, Lexy J. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2018.
- Minarti, Sri. *Ilmu Pendidikan Islam: Fakta Teoritis-Filosofis dan Aplikatif*. Jakarta: Amzah, 2013.
- Mukhlis, Afrizal Nur. "Konsep Wasathiyah dalam Al-Qur'an" (Studi Komparatif Antara Tafsir AT-Tahrir Wa At-Tanwir dan Al-Sae AT-Tafsir), *Jurnal An-Nur*, Vol. 4, No. 2, (2015): 212-213.
- Mulyasa, Enco. *Menjadi Guru Profesional, Menciptakan Pembelajaran Kreatif dan Menyenangkan*, Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya. 2015.
- Naqiyah, Khoriddatun. "Peran Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Membentuk Sikap Moderasi Beragama Siswa di SMAN 2 Bae Kudus". *Skripsi-Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kudus*, 2020.
- Nisa', Madawinun. "Integrasi Nilai-nilai Moderasi Pada Anak Usia Dini berbasis Living Values Education (LVE)", *Jurnal AnCom*, (21-22 April 2018): 1.
- NS, Habibur Rohman. "Upaya membentuk sikap Moderasi Beragama Mahasiswa di UPT Ma'had Al-Jami'ah UIN Raden Intan Lampung". *Skripsi-Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Intan Lampung*, 2021.
- Nurulmanwar, Rosyida. Muhayati, Siti. "Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pendidikan Agama Islam Pada Mahasiswa Perguruan Tinggi Umum" *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, volume 12. No. 1. (2021)
- Poerwadarminto, W.J.S. *Kamus Umum Bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 1986.
- Riadi, Dayun. dkk., *Ilmu Pendidikan Islam*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2017.

- Rohman, Adi Nur. "Internalisasi Nilai-nilai Islam Dalam Praksis Demokrasi Di Indonesia", *Jurnal HIMMAH* Vol. 2, No. 1-2 (Desember 2018): 92.
- Safi'i, I., & Ikmal, H. (2020). Multiculturalism In Indonesian Civilization (Critical, Tolerant, And Empaty). *Jurnal Al-Murabbi*, 6(1), 38-47.
- Saifuddin, Lukman Hakim. *Moderasi Beragama*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama RI, 2019.
- Sari, Anjeli Aliya Purnama. "Penerapan Nilai-nilai Moderasi Beragama Pada Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini Melalui Pendidikan Agama Islam". *Skripsi-Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Bengkulu*, 2021.
- Sarman, Mukhtar. *Meretas Radikalisme Menuju Masyarakat Inklusif*. Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2018.
- Sidiq, Umar. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Di Bidang Pendidikan*. Ponorogo: CV. Nata Karya, cet I, 2019.
- Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian: Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2015.
- Sukardja, Ahmad. *Hukum Tata Negara dan Hukum Administrasi Negara Dalam Perspektif Fiqih Siyasa*. Jakarta: Sinar Grafika, 2012.
- Thoha, As'ad. *Pendidikan Aswaja Dan Ke-NU-An Untuk MA/SMA/SMK Kelas 12, Kurikulum 2012*. Jawa Timur: PWLP Ma'arif Nu, 2013.
- Umar, Nasaruddin. *Islam Nusantara Jalan Panjang Moderasi Di Indonesia* Jakarta: PT Gramedia, 2019.
- Undang-undang RI No. 20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional. Bandung: Citra Umbara, 2003.
- Widodo, Erna. dan Mukhtar. *Konstruksi ke Arah Penelitian Deskriptif*. Yogyakarta: 2000.
- WS, Indrawan. *Kamus Lengkap Bahasa Indonesia*. Jombang: Lintas Media, 2000.